#### Proof by Morgan Bryant, Issac Mammal, Adam Melrod. Exposition by William Gasarch

April 3, 2022

**Def**  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is **large** if  $|A| > \min(A)$ .

**Def**  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is **large** if  $|A| > \min(A)$ .

**Def** PH(k) is the least  $n \ge$  such that for all 2-colorings of  $\binom{\{k,\dots,n\}}{2}$  there exists a set H such that the following hold.

**Def**  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is **large** if  $|A| > \min(A)$ .

**Def** PH(k) is the least  $n \ge$  such that for all 2-colorings of  $\binom{\{k,\dots,n\}}{2}$  there exists a set H such that the following hold.

H is homog.

**Def**  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is **large** if  $|A| > \min(A)$ .

**Def** PH(k) is the least  $n \ge$  such that for all 2-colorings of  $\binom{\{k,\dots,n\}}{2}$  there exists a set H such that the following hold.

- ► *H* is homog.
- $ightharpoonup |H| > \min(H).$

**Def**  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is **large** if  $|A| > \min(A)$ .

**Def** PH(k) is the least  $n \ge$  such that for all 2-colorings of  $\binom{\{k,\dots,n\}}{2}$  there exists a set H such that the following hold.

- ► *H* is homog.
- $ightharpoonup |H| > \min(H).$
- ▶  $|H| \ge 3$ .

**Def**  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is **large** if  $|A| > \min(A)$ .

**Def** PH(k) is the least  $n \ge$  such that for all 2-colorings of  $\binom{\{k,\dots,n\}}{2}$  there exists a set H such that the following hold.

- ► *H* is homog.
- $ightharpoonup |H| > \min(H).$
- ▶  $|H| \ge 3$ .

(PH stands for Paris-Harrington.)

**Def**  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is **large** if  $|A| > \min(A)$ .

**Def** PH(k) is the least  $n \ge$  such that for all 2-colorings of  $\binom{\{k,\dots,n\}}{2}$  there exists a set H such that the following hold.

- ► *H* is homog.
- ▶  $|H| > \min(H)$ .
- ▶  $|H| \ge 3$ .

(PH stands for Paris-Harrington.)

**Notation** We call a set like H a Large Homog Set and abbreviate this by LHS.

Let COL:  $\binom{\{1,\dots,7\}}{2} \rightarrow [2]$ . We show there is a LHS.

Let COL:  $\binom{\{1,\dots,7\}}{2} \rightarrow [2]$ . We show there is a LHS.

Note The graph has 7 vertices so every point has degree 6.

Let COL:  $\binom{\{1,\dots,7\}}{2} \rightarrow [2]$ . We show there is a LHS.

Note The graph has 7 vertices so every point has degree 6.

**Assume** We can assum COL(1, 2) = R.

The 3 smallest *R*-Nbhs of 1 are  $2 = x_1 < x_2 < x_3$ .

The 3 smallest *R*-Nbhs of 1 are  $2 = x_1 < x_2 < x_3$ .

▶  $(\exists 1 \le i < j \le 3)[COL(x_i, x_j) = R]$ . LHS:  $\{1, x_i, x_j\}$ .

The 3 smallest *R*-Nbhs of 1 are  $2 = x_1 < x_2 < x_3$ .

- ▶  $(\exists 1 \le i < j \le 3)[COL(x_i, x_j) = R]$ . LHS:  $\{1, x_i, x_j\}$ .
- ►  $(\forall 1 \le i < j \le 3)[COL(x_i, x_j) = B]$ . LHS:  $\{2, x_2, x_3\}$

The 4 smallest R-Nbhs are  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

The 4 smallest *R*-Nbhs are  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

▶  $(\exists 1 \le i < j \le 4)[COL(x_i, x_j) = B]$ . LHS:  $\{1, x_i, x_j\}$ .

The 4 smallest *R*-Nbhs are  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

- ▶  $(\exists 1 \le i < j \le 4)[COL(x_i, x_j) = B]$ . LHS:  $\{1, x_i, x_j\}$ .
- $(\forall 1 \le i < j \le 4)[COL(x_i, x_j) = \mathbb{R} \land x_1 = 3.$   $LHS: \{x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4\}.$

The 4 smallest *R*-Nbhs are  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

- ▶  $(\exists 1 \le i < j \le 4)[COL(x_i, x_j) = B]$ . LHS:  $\{1, x_i, x_j\}$ .
- $(\forall 1 \le i < j \le 4)[COL(x_i, x_j) = \mathbb{R} \land x_1 = 3.$   $LHS: \{x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4\}.$

Last Case on Next Slide.

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

**Remaining Case** 

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

#### **Remaining Case**

$$(\forall 1 \leq i < j \leq 4[COL(x_i, x_j) = B \land x_1 \geq 4].$$

1)  $x_1 \ge 5$ . Then  $x_2 \ge 6$ ,  $x_3 \ge 7$ ,  $x_4 \ge 8$ . Contradiction.

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

#### **Remaining Case**

$$(\forall 1 \leq i < j \leq 4[COL(x_i, x_j) = B \land x_1 \geq 4].$$

- 1)  $x_1 \ge 5$ . Then  $x_2 \ge 6$ ,  $x_3 \ge 7$ ,  $x_4 \ge 8$ . Contradiction.
- 2)  $x_1 = 4$ ,  $x_2 = 5$ ,  $x_3 = 6$ ,  $x_4 = 7$ . So R-nbhs of 1 are  $\{2, 3\}$ .

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

#### **Remaining Case**

- $(\forall 1 \leq i < j \leq 4[COL(x_i, x_j) = B \land x_1 \geq 4].$
- 1)  $x_1 \ge 5$ . Then  $x_2 \ge 6$ ,  $x_3 \ge 7$ ,  $x_4 \ge 8$ . Contradiction.
- 2)  $x_1 = 4$ ,  $x_2 = 5$ ,  $x_3 = 6$ ,  $x_4 = 7$ . So *R*-nbhs of 1 are  $\{2,3\}$ . Cases

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

#### **Remaining Case**

$$(\forall 1 \leq i < j \leq 4[COL(x_i, x_j) = B \land x_1 \geq 4].$$

- 1)  $x_1 \ge 5$ . Then  $x_2 \ge 6$ ,  $x_3 \ge 7$ ,  $x_4 \ge 8$ . Contradiction.
- 2)  $x_1 = 4$ ,  $x_2 = 5$ ,  $x_3 = 6$ ,  $x_4 = 7$ . So *R*-nbhs of 1 are  $\{2, 3\}$ .

#### **Cases**

 $ightharpoonup COL(2,3) = R. LHS: \{1,2,3\}.$ 

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

#### **Remaining Case**

$$(\forall 1 \leq i < j \leq 4[COL(x_i, x_j) = B \land x_1 \geq 4].$$

- 1)  $x_1 \ge 5$ . Then  $x_2 \ge 6$ ,  $x_3 \ge 7$ ,  $x_4 \ge 8$ . Contradiction.
- 2)  $x_1 = 4$ ,  $x_2 = 5$ ,  $x_3 = 6$ ,  $x_4 = 7$ . So R-nbhs of 1 are  $\{2,3\}$ .

#### **Cases**

- $ightharpoonup COL(2,3) = R. LHS: \{1,2,3\}.$
- ► COL(2,3) = B.
  - a)  $(\exists 4 \le i \le 7)[COL(i, 2) = COL(i, 3) = B. LHS: \{2, 3, i\}.$

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

#### **Remaining Case**

- $(\forall 1 \leq i < j \leq 4[COL(x_i, x_j) = B \land x_1 \geq 4].$
- 1)  $x_1 \ge 5$ . Then  $x_2 \ge 6$ ,  $x_3 \ge 7$ ,  $x_4 \ge 8$ . Contradiction.
- 2)  $x_1 = 4$ ,  $x_2 = 5$ ,  $x_3 = 6$ ,  $x_4 = 7$ . So R-nbhs of 1 are  $\{2,3\}$ .

#### **Cases**

- $ightharpoonup COL(2,3) = R. LHS: \{1,2,3\}.$
- ► COL(2,3) = B.
  - a)  $(\exists 4 \le i \le 7)[COL(i, 2) = COL(i, 3) = B. LHS: \{2, 3, i\}.$
  - b)  $(\forall 4 \le i \le 7)[COL(i,2) = \mathbb{R} \lor COL(i,3) = \mathbb{R}].$
  - Map  $i \in \{4, 5, 6, 7\}$  to  $j \in \{2, 3\}$  st  $COL(i, j) = \mathbb{R}$ .

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

#### **Remaining Case**

- $(\forall 1 \leq i < j \leq 4[COL(x_i, x_j) = B \land x_1 \geq 4].$
- 1)  $x_1 \ge 5$ . Then  $x_2 \ge 6$ ,  $x_3 \ge 7$ ,  $x_4 \ge 8$ . Contradiction.
- 2)  $x_1 = 4$ ,  $x_2 = 5$ ,  $x_3 = 6$ ,  $x_4 = 7$ . So R-nbhs of 1 are  $\{2,3\}$ .

#### Cases

- ightharpoonup COL(2,3) = R. LHS:  $\{1,2,3\}$ .
- ► COL(2,3) = B.
  - a)  $(\exists 4 \le i \le 7)[COL(i, 2) = COL(i, 3) = B. LHS: \{2, 3, i\}.$
  - b)  $(\forall 4 \leq i \leq 7)[COL(i,2) = R \lor COL(i,3) = R].$
  - Map  $i \in \{4, 5, 6, 7\}$  to  $j \in \{2, 3\}$  st  $COL(i, j) = \mathbb{R}$ .
  - $(\exists i, j \in \{4, 5, 6, 7\})$  map to  $2 \to \mathsf{LHS}\ \{2, i, j\}$ .

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

#### **Remaining Case**

- $(\forall 1 \leq i < j \leq 4[COL(x_i, x_j) = B \land x_1 \geq 4].$
- 1)  $x_1 \ge 5$ . Then  $x_2 \ge 6$ ,  $x_3 \ge 7$ ,  $x_4 \ge 8$ . Contradiction.
- 2)  $x_1 = 4$ ,  $x_2 = 5$ ,  $x_3 = 6$ ,  $x_4 = 7$ . So R-nbhs of 1 are  $\{2,3\}$ .

#### **Cases**

- $ightharpoonup COL(2,3) = R. LHS: \{1,2,3\}.$
- ► COL(2,3) = B.
  - a)  $(\exists 4 \le i \le 7)[COL(i,2) = COL(i,3) = B$ . LHS:  $\{2,3,i\}$ .
  - b)  $(\forall 4 \le i \le 7)[COL(i, 2) = R \lor COL(i, 3) = R].$

Map  $i \in \{4, 5, 6, 7\}$  to  $j \in \{2, 3\}$  st  $COL(i, j) = \mathbb{R}$ .

 $(\exists i, j \in \{4, 5, 6, 7\})$  map to  $2 \to LHS \{2, i, j\}$ .

 $(\exists i, j, k \in \{4, 5, 6, 7\})$  map to  $3 \to \text{then LHS } \{3, i, j, k\}.$ 

The 4 smallest R-neighbors of 1 be  $x_1 < x_2 < x_3 < x_4$ .

#### **Remaining Case**

- $(\forall 1 \leq i < j \leq 4[COL(x_i, x_j) = B \land x_1 \geq 4].$
- 1)  $x_1 \ge 5$ . Then  $x_2 \ge 6$ ,  $x_3 \ge 7$ ,  $x_4 \ge 8$ . Contradiction.
- 2)  $x_1 = 4$ ,  $x_2 = 5$ ,  $x_3 = 6$ ,  $x_4 = 7$ . So R-nbhs of 1 are  $\{2, 3\}$ .

#### Cases

- $ightharpoonup COL(2,3) = R. LHS: \{1,2,3\}.$
- ► COL(2,3) = B.
  - a)  $(\exists 4 \le i \le 7)[COL(i, 2) = COL(i, 3) = B. LHS: \{2, 3, i\}.$
  - b)  $(\forall 4 \le i \le 7)[COL(i,2) = \mathbb{R} \lor COL(i,3) = \mathbb{R}].$

Map  $i \in \{4, 5, 6, 7\}$  to  $j \in \{2, 3\}$  st  $COL(i, j) = \mathbb{R}$ .

 $(\exists i, j \in \{4, 5, 6, 7\})$  map to  $2 \to LHS \{2, i, j\}$ .

 $(\exists i, j, k \in \{4, 5, 6, 7\})$  map to  $3 \to \text{then LHS } \{3, i, j, k\}.$ 

If neither happens then  $\leq 1$  element of  $\{4,5,6,7\}$  maps to 2 and  $\leq 2$  elements of  $\{4,5,6,7\}$  map to 3. So  $\leq 3$  elements get mapped, contradiction.

### Case 3: NOT Case 1 or 2

If neither Case 1 or Case 2 happens then

#### Case 3: NOT Case 1 or 2

If neither Case 1 or Case 2 happens then

▶  $\deg_{\mathbf{R}}(1) \leq 2$ 

#### Case 3: NOT Case 1 or 2

If neither Case 1 or Case 2 happens then

- ▶  $\deg_{\mathbf{R}}(1) \leq 2$
- ▶  $deg_{\mathbf{B}}(1) \leq 3$

So  $deg(1) \le 5$  which is a contradiction.