

Bill's Bad Advice and Good Advice

William Gasarch-U of MD

Plan For This Talk

Plan For This Talk

Lots of slides on my BAD ADVICE

Plan For This Talk

Lots of slides on my BAD ADVICE

A few slides on my GOOD ADVICE.

Part I

BILL'S BAD ADVICE

What Is Bill Bad's Advice?

What Is Bill Bad's Advice?

We give advice that is **bad** for many people but

What Is Bill Bad's Advice?

We give advice that is **bad** for many people but

1) Some of the advice is good for all people

What Is Bill Bad's Advice?

We give advice that is **bad** for many people but

- 1) Some of the advice is good for all people
- 2) All of the advice is good for some people.

What Is Bill Bad's Advice?

We give advice that is **bad** for many people but

- 1) Some of the advice is good for all people
- 2) All of the advice is good for some people.
- 3) Some of the advice is good for some people.

What NOT to Care About

What NOT to Care About

When to work on a problem?

What NOT to Care About

When to work on a problem?

1) **Don't Care** if anyone else cares. If YOU care then that is enough to at least get started.

What NOT to Care About

When to work on a problem?

- 1) **Don't Care** if anyone else cares. If YOU care then that is enough to at least get started.
- 2) **Don't Care** if it has the potential for a published paper.

What NOT to Care About

When to work on a problem?

1) **Don't Care** if anyone else cares. If YOU care then that is enough to at least get started.

2) **Don't Care** if it has the potential for a published paper.

FIRST do the work. Then maybe consider good venue.

What NOT to Care About

When to work on a problem?

- 1) **Don't Care** if anyone else cares. If YOU care then that is enough to at least get started.
- 2) **Don't Care** if it has the potential for a published paper.
FIRST do the work. Then maybe consider good venue.
- 3) **Don't Care** if it has practical implications.

What NOT to Care About

When to work on a problem?

- 1) **Don't Care** if anyone else cares. If YOU care then that is enough to at least get started.
- 2) **Don't Care** if it has the potential for a published paper.
FIRST do the work. Then maybe consider good venue.
- 3) **Don't Care** if it has practical implications. (A shocker!)

What NOT to Care About

When to work on a problem?

1) **Don't Care** if anyone else cares. If YOU care then that is enough to at least get started.

2) **Don't Care** if it has the potential for a published paper.
FIRST do the work. Then maybe consider good venue.

3) **Don't Care** if it has practical implications. (A shocker!)

4) **Don't Care** if you can get a grant for it (unless its an REU grant- then I care). With the current state of the NSF this advice may soon become irrelevant.

What NOT to Care About

When to work on a problem?

- 1) **Don't Care** if anyone else cares. If YOU care then that is enough to at least get started.
- 2) **Don't Care** if it has the potential for a published paper.
FIRST do the work. Then maybe consider good venue.
- 3) **Don't Care** if it has practical implications. (A shocker!)
- 4) **Don't Care** if you can get a grant for it (unless its an REU grant- then I care). With the current state of the NSF this advice may soon become irrelevant.
- 5) **Don't Care** if someone else already did it.

What NOT to Care About

When to work on a problem?

- 1) **Don't Care** if anyone else cares. If YOU care then that is enough to at least get started.
- 2) **Don't Care** if it has the potential for a published paper.
FIRST do the work. Then maybe consider good venue.
- 3) **Don't Care** if it has practical implications. (A shocker!)
- 4) **Don't Care** if you can get a grant for it (unless its an REU grant- then I care). With the current state of the NSF this advice may soon become irrelevant.
- 5) **Don't Care** if someone else already did it.

Even if you work on it and find someone else did it, you will have LEARNED about the problem through your efforts.

Why To NOT CARE

Why To NOT CARE

Why should you **not care** about any of these things?

Why To NOT CARE

Why should you **not care** about any of these things?

Because they get in the way of actually **doing** something.

Why To NOT CARE

Why should you **not care** about any of these things?

Because they get in the way of actually **doing** something.

They are a distraction to following your interests.

I Give Examples

I Give Examples

I will give examples of this approach. I leave it to the reader to determine if they are examples my advice being bad or good.

Examples One: Muffins

Examples One: Muffins

I read about **The Muffin Problem** in a pamphlet at a conference.

Examples One: Muffins

I read about **The Muffin Problem** in a pamphlet at a conference.
Three years later and they call me **The Muffin Man**.

Examples One: Muffins

I read about **The Muffin Problem** in a pamphlet at a conference.

Three years later and they call me **The Muffin Man**.

All I wanted was to get some High School and Undergraduate Projects out of it.

Examples One: Muffins

I read about **The Muffin Problem** in a pamphlet at a conference.

Three years later and they call me **The Muffin Man**.

All I wanted was to get some High School and Undergraduate Projects out of it.

I ended up with a book on it which made me twenty dollars last year!

Examples One: Muffins

I read about **The Muffin Problem** in a pamphlet at a conference.

Three years later and they call me **The Muffin Man**.

All I wanted was to get some High School and Undergraduate Projects out of it.

I ended up with a book on it which made me twenty dollars last year!

I learned a lot, as did my co-authors and I am happy with the book.

Examples One: Muffins

I read about **The Muffin Problem** in a pamphlet at a conference.

Three years later and they call me **The Muffin Man**.

All I wanted was to get some High School and Undergraduate Projects out of it.

I ended up with a book on it which made me twenty dollars last year!

I learned a lot, as did my co-authors and I am happy with the book.

The co-authors were undergrads so my dept put me up for a mentoring award (I have other credentials as well).

Examples One: Muffins

I read about **The Muffin Problem** in a pamphlet at a conference.

Three years later and they call me **The Muffin Man**.

All I wanted was to get some High School and Undergraduate Projects out of it.

I ended up with a book on it which made me twenty dollars last year!

I learned a lot, as did my co-authors and I am happy with the book.

The co-authors were undergrads so my dept put me up for a mentoring award (I have other credentials as well).

I did not win, but I got a nice letter saying they had many qualified applicants.

Examples One: Muffins

I read about **The Muffin Problem** in a pamphlet at a conference.

Three years later and they call me **The Muffin Man**.

All I wanted was to get some High School and Undergraduate Projects out of it.

I ended up with a book on it which made me twenty dollars last year!

I learned a lot, as did my co-authors and I am happy with the book.

The co-authors were undergrads so my dept put me up for a mentoring award (I have other credentials as well).

I did not win, but I got a nice letter saying they had many qualified applicants.

It didn't say if I was one of them.

Examples Two: Random Ramsey Theory

Examples Two: Random Ramsey Theory

I taught a group of HS students Ramsey Theory.

Examples Two: Random Ramsey Theory

I taught a group of HS students Ramsey Theory.

I had them code up what happens if you color the edges **randomly**

Examples Two: Random Ramsey Theory

I taught a group of HS students Ramsey Theory.

I had them code up what happens if you color the edges **randomly**

They learned a lot of Ramsey Theory, and got experience coding.

Examples Two: Random Ramsey Theory

I taught a group of HS students Ramsey Theory.

I had them code up what happens if you color the edges **randomly**

They learned a lot of Ramsey Theory, and got experience coding.

For them it satisfied a HS requirement.

Examples Two: Random Ramsey Theory

I taught a group of HS students Ramsey Theory.

I had them code up what happens if you color the edges **randomly**

They learned a lot of Ramsey Theory, and got experience coding.

For them it satisfied a HS requirement.

By giving them talks I got some typos out of my slides.

Examples Two: Random Ramsey Theory

I taught a group of HS students Ramsey Theory.

I had them code up what happens if you color the edges **randomly**

They learned a lot of Ramsey Theory, and got experience coding.

For them it satisfied a HS requirement.

By giving them talks I got some typos out of my slides.

No paper came out of this, but I didn't think that would happen anyway.

Examples Three: The Lines Problem

Examples Three: The Lines Problem

I could not go to a Math Meeting. I looked at the website.

Examples Three: The Lines Problem

I could not go to a Math Meeting. I looked at the website.
Website has a set of papers on Euclidean Ramsey theory.

Examples Three: The Lines Problem

I could not go to a Math Meeting. I looked at the website.
Website has a set of papers on Euclidean Ramsey theory.
I found the $\mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow (L_2-L_{10^{10}})$ paper.

Examples Three: The Lines Problem

I could not go to a Math Meeting. I looked at the website.

Website has a set of papers on Euclidean Ramsey theory.

I found the $\mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow (L_2-L_{10^{10}})$ paper.

I tracked down papers on L_a-L_b and put them on a website.

Examples Three: The Lines Problem

I could not go to a Math Meeting. I looked at the website.

Website has a set of papers on Euclidean Ramsey theory.

I found the $\mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow (L_2-L_{10^{10}})$ paper.

I tracked down papers on L_a-L_b and put them on a website.

I wanted a well written account of all that was known.

Examples Three: The Lines Problem

I could not go to a Math Meeting. I looked at the website.

Website has a set of papers on Euclidean Ramsey theory.

I found the $\mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow (L_2-L_{10^{10}})$ paper.

I tracked down papers on L_a-L_b and put them on a website.

I wanted a well written account of all that was known.

Over Time Many students (including the REU students) read these papers, wrote them up, and even got some new results.

Examples Three: The Lines Problem

I could not go to a Math Meeting. I looked at the website.

Website has a set of papers on Euclidean Ramsey theory.

I found the $\mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow (L_2-L_{10^{10}})$ paper.

I tracked down papers on L_a-L_b and put them on a website.

I wanted a well written account of all that was known.

Over Time Many students (including the REU students) read these papers, wrote them up, and even got some new results.

Current Plans We will gather all of this up and create a very long document that has all that is known.

Examples Three: The Lines Problem

I could not go to a Math Meeting. I looked at the website.

Website has a set of papers on Euclidean Ramsey theory.

I found the $\mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow (L_2-L_{10^{10}})$ paper.

I tracked down papers on L_a-L_b and put them on a website.

I wanted a well written account of all that was known.

Over Time Many students (including the REU students) read these papers, wrote them up, and even got some new results.

Current Plans We will gather all of this up and create a very long document that has all that is known.

What to do with this report? For now I DON'T CARE.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem

Oliver Roeder problems on Nate Silver's blog:
this problem:

A sequence $a_1, a_2, \dots$ is **n -good** if

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem

Oliver Roeder problems on Nate Silver's blog:
this problem:

A sequence $a_1, a_2, \dots$ is **n -good** if
 $(\forall i)[a_i \in \{1, \dots, n\}]$

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem

Oliver Roeder problems on Nate Silver's blog:
this problem:

A sequence $a_1, a_2, \dots$ is **n -good** if

$(\forall i)[a_i \in \{1, \dots, n\}]$

$(\forall i \geq 2)[a_i \text{ either divides } a_{i-1} \text{ or is a multiple of } a_{i-1}].$

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem

Oliver Roeder problems on Nate Silver's blog:
this problem:

A sequence $a_1, a_2, \dots$ is **n -good** if

$(\forall i)[a_i \in \{1, \dots, n\}]$

$(\forall i \geq 2)[a_i \text{ either divides } a_{i-1} \text{ or is a multiple of } a_{i-1}].$

Example of 20-sequence

7, 14, 2, 4, 12, 3, 15, 5, 20.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

Find the longest 100-sequence.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

Find the longest 100-sequence.

My Answer and the Real Answer

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

Find the longest 100-sequence.

My Answer and the Real Answer

I got a good 100-sequence of length 42.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

Find the longest 100-sequence.

My Answer and the Real Answer

I got a good 100-sequence of length 42.

Two other readers used a computer to get a 100-seq of length 77.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

Find the longest 100-sequence.

My Answer and the Real Answer

I got a good 100-sequence of length 42.

Two other readers used a computer to get a 100-seq of length 77.

They also proved there is no longer 100-seq.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

I worked with PhD students David Harris and his son Tomas, a HS student, on these sequenes.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

I worked with PhD students David Harris and his son Tomas, a HS student, on these sequenes.

I wrote up what they did.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

I worked with PhD students David Harris and his son Tomas, a HS student, on these sequenes.

I wrote up what they did.

We then found out that everything we did was known in papers that were in French.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

I worked with PhD students David Harris and his son Tomas, a HS student, on these sequenes.

I wrote up what they did.

We then found out that everything we did was known in papers that were in French.

Tomas was still happy to have learned some math.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

I worked with PhD students David Harris and his son Tomas, a HS student, on these sequenes.

I wrote up what they did.

We then found out that everything we did was known in papers that were in French.

Tomas was still happy to have learned some math.

Bill was still happy to have learned some math.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

I worked with PhD students David Harris and his son Tomas, a HS student, on these sequenes.

I wrote up what they did.

We then found out that everything we did was known in papers that were in French.

Tomas was still happy to have learned some math.

Bill was still happy to have learned some math.

David was bummed out since he wanted to get a publication.

Examples Four: The Roeder Problem (cont)

I worked with PhD students David Harris and his son Tomas, a HS student, on these sequenes.

I wrote up what they did.

We then found out that everything we did was known in papers that were in French.

Tomas was still happy to have learned some math.

Bill was still happy to have learned some math.

David was bummed out since he wanted to get a publication.

However, he was happy that his son learned some math.

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

- 1) Bad advice for pre-tenure profs who need paper. E.g., Laxman.

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

- 1) Bad advice for pre-tenure profs who need paper. E.g., Laxman.
- 2) Once you get tenure you have job security and hence can change fields or follow my bad advice without consequences.

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

- 1) Bad advice for pre-tenure profs who need paper. E.g., Laxman.
- 2) Once you get tenure you have job security and hence can change fields or follow my bad advice without consequences. But with grants and salary and teaching load issues, be careful.

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

- 1) Bad advice for pre-tenure profs who need paper. E.g., Laxman.
- 2) Once you get tenure you have job security and hence can change fields or follow my bad advice without consequences. But with grants and salary and teaching load issues, be careful.
- 3) HS Students are my main audience for Bill's Bad Advice.

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

- 1) Bad advice for pre-tenure profs who need paper. E.g., Laxman.
- 2) Once you get tenure you have job security and hence can change fields or follow my bad advice without consequences. But with grants and salary and teaching load issues, be careful.
- 3) HS Students are my main audience for Bill's Bad Advice. It's not as important for them to get papers out as for (say) assistant professors.

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

- 1) Bad advice for pre-tenure profs who need paper. E.g., Laxman.
 - 2) Once you get tenure you have job security and hence can change fields or follow my bad advice without consequences. But with grants and salary and teaching load issues, be careful.
 - 3) HS Students are my main audience for Bill's Bad Advice. It's not as important for them to get papers out as for (say) assistant professors.
- This is changing. Colleges are getting more competitive. And HS students may well want a project that can lead to Science competitions.

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

- 1) Bad advice for pre-tenure profs who need paper. E.g., Laxman.
- 2) Once you get tenure you have job security and hence can change fields or follow my bad advice without consequences. But with grants and salary and teaching load issues, be careful.
- 3) HS Students are my main audience for Bill's Bad Advice. It's not as important for them to get papers out as for (say) assistant professors.
This is changing. Colleges are getting more competitive. And HS students may well want a project that can lead to Science competitions.
- 4) Similar for Ugrads.

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

- 1) Bad advice for pre-tenure profs who need paper. E.g., Laxman.
- 2) Once you get tenure you have job security and hence can change fields or follow my bad advice without consequences. But with grants and salary and teaching load issues, be careful.
- 3) HS Students are my main audience for Bill's Bad Advice. It's not as important for them to get papers out as for (say) assistant professors.
This is changing. Colleges are getting more competitive. And HS students may well want a project that can lead to Science competitions.
- 4) Similar for Ugrads.
- 5) Full Professors may have more freedom to follow my bad advice.

For Whom is this Bad Advice? Good Advice?

- 1) Bad advice for pre-tenure profs who need paper. E.g., Laxman.
- 2) Once you get tenure you have job security and hence can change fields or follow my bad advice without consequences. But with grants and salary and teaching load issues, be careful.
- 3) HS Students are my main audience for Bill's Bad Advice. It's not as important for them to get papers out as for (say) assistant professors.
This is changing. Colleges are getting more competitive. And HS students may well want a project that can lead to Science competitions.
- 4) Similar for Ugrads.
- 5) Full Professors may have more freedom to follow my bad advice. One example: I follow Bill's Bad Advice and look what its gotten me!

Part II

BILL'S GOOD ADVICE

Follow Your Heart

Follow Your Heart

This may be a cliché, but I advise you to
follow your heart!

Follow Your Heart

This may be a cliché, but I advise you to
follow your heart!

I don't mean this for romance (though it's probably true there as well).

Follow Your Heart

This may be a cliché, but I advise you to
follow your heart!

I don't mean this for romance (though it's probably true there as well).

I mean that even if you have an impossible dream, pursue it as good may come out of it even if you don't succeed.

Follow Your Heart

This may be a cliché, but I advise you to
follow your heart!

I don't mean this for romance (though it's probably true there as well).

I mean that even if you have an impossible dream, pursue it as good may come out of it even if you don't succeed.

On the next slide I give an example of a truly impossible dream just as an example.

Absurd Example

Absurd Example

Imagine that you are born a girl in a country that does not allow girls to sing in public.

Absurd Example

Imagine that you are born a girl in a country that does not allow girls to sing in public.

Imagine that you want to be an opera singer.

Absurd Example

Imagine that you are born a girl in a country that does not allow girls to sing in public.

Imagine that you want to be an opera singer.

An Absurd Dream!

Absurd Example

Imagine that you are born a girl in a country that does not allow girls to sing in public.

Imagine that you want to be an opera singer.

An Absurd Dream!

My advice is to try anyway.

Absurd Example

Imagine that you are born a girl in a country that does not allow girls to sing in public.

Imagine that you want to be an opera singer.

An Absurd Dream!

My advice is to try anyway.

Now you probably have less absurd dreams, so easier to try anyway.

Wrap up This Part of the Talk

Wrap up This Part of the Talk

So even if your dream is as absurd as singing opera in a country that does not allow it—

Wrap up This Part of the Talk

So even if your dream is as absurd as singing opera in a country that does not allow it—

YASMINE Its not absurd!

Wrap up This Part of the Talk

So even if your dream is as absurd as singing opera in a country that does not allow it—

YASMINE Its not absurd!

BILL I didn't mean any offense. Its fair to say that it would be impossible to become an opera singer if you are a female born in a country where women are now allowed to sing. But just because its impossible, there is no reason to not try.

Wrap up This Part of the Talk

So even if your dream is as absurd as singing opera in a country that does not allow it—

YASMINE Its not absurd!

BILL I didn't mean any offense. Its fair to say that it would be impossible to become an opera singer if you are a female born in a country where women are now allowed to sing. But just because its impossible, there is no reason to not try.

YASMINE It's not impossible!

Wrap up This Part of the Talk

So even if your dream is as absurd as singing opera in a country that does not allow it—

YASMINE Its not absurd!

BILL I didn't mean any offense. Its fair to say that it would be impossible to become an opera singer if you are a female born in a country where women are now allowed to sing. But just because its impossible, there is no reason to not try.

YASMINE It's not impossible!

BILL Okay, then show me an example of someone who has done this.

Yasmine Sings!

Yasmine Sings!

Yasmine Sings!

Yasmine Sings!

Yasmine Sings!

She takes a bow!

Yasmine Sings!

Yasmine Sings!

She takes a bow!

The audience applauds!