

**How Does the Web and AI Do
On the Question of
What Pair of Brothers Won the Most Games
In Baseball**

1 Introduction

We look at the history of the question:

What pair of brothers had the most wins in baseball?

We then look at what the web and ChatGPT had to say. Spoiler alert: the web and chatty need to brush up on their baseball history.

2 The Top Few Spots

We first discuss the top four slots in the modern era which is considered (arbitrarily?) to be 1900. We then discuss a case that was (a) before 1900, and (b) involves three brothers.

that you may not want to count.

3 Christy and Harry Mathewson

Before April 23, 1974 if you asked the question

What pair of brothers had the most wins in baseball?

it was a trick question since the answer was

Christy Mathewson (W-L was 373-188) and Harry Mathewson (W-L was 0-1) for a total of 373.

Christy played from 1900 until 1916. Harry played in 1902.

Note that Christy was a superstar and Harry really didn't do much in the major leagues.

The year 1900 is when people draw the line and say that's where modern baseball began. Hence the record held by Christy and Harry was considered the modern record.

4 Gaylord and Jim Perry

On September 6, 1973, Gaylord Perry had won 172 games and his brother Jim had one 200. So they combined for 372 wins.

- On September 7, 1973, Gaylord Perry won his 173rd game, so their total tied Christy and Harry, at 373 wins.
- On September 12, 1973, Gaylord Perry won his 174rd game, so their total exceeded Christy and Harry, at 374 wins.

Hence the question

What pair of brothers had the most wins in baseball?

Was no longer a trick question.

Gaylord Perry retired at the end of the 1983 season with 314 wins. He is in the Major League Baseball Hall of Fame. Jim Perry retired at the end of the 1975 season with 215 wins. He is not in the Major League Baseball Hall of Fame.

At the end of the 1983 season the record for most wins by a pair of brothers was $314 + 215 = 529$.

Gaylord's career was from 1962 until 1983 and he had a record of 314-265.

Jim's career was from 1959 until 1975 and he had a record of 215-174.

Note that Gaylord was a superstar and Jim was a solid player.

4.1 Phil and Joe Niekro

On May 22, 1987, Phil Niekro had won 313 games and his brother Joe had one 215. So they combined for 528 wins.

- On May 23, 1987, Joe Niekro won his 216th game, so their total tied Gaylord and Jim, at 529 wins.
- On June 1, 1987, Phil Niekro won his 314th game, so their total exceeded Gaylord and Jim, at 530 wins.

Phil Niekro retired at the end of the 1987 season with 318 wins. He is in the Major League Baseball Hall of Fame. Joe Niekro retired at the end of the 1988 season with 221 wins. He is not in the Major League Baseball Hall of Fame.

At the end of the 1983 season the record for most wins by a pair of brothers was $318 + 221 = 539$.

Phil's career was from 1964 until 1987 and he had a record of 318-274.

Jim's career was from 1967 until 1988 and he had a record of 221-204.

Note that Phil was as superstar and Joe was a solid player.

4.2 Greg and Mike Maddux

On Aug 23, 2007, Greg Maddux had won 333th games and his brother Joe had one 39. So they combined for 372 wins.

- On Aug 24, 2007, Greg Maddux won his 334th game, so their total tied Christy and Harry, at 373 wins.
- On Aug 26, 2007, Greg Maddux won his 335th game, so their total exceeded Christy and Harry, at 374 wins.

Greg Maddux retired at the end of the 2008 season with 355 wins. He is in the Major League Baseball Hall of Fame. Mike Maddux retired at the end of the 2000 season with 39 wins. He is not in the Major League Baseball Hall of Fame. However, the 39 wins is an unfair way to look at his career. He was an effective relief pitcher who had a 14 year career.

At the end of the 2008 season the record for third most wins by a pair of brothers was $355 + 39 = 394$.

Greg's career was from 1986 until 2008 and he had a record of 355-227.

Mike's career was from 1986 until 2000 and he had a record of 39-37.

Note that Greg was as superstar and Mike was a good pitcher whose role was not the type to get many wins.

4.3 John, Dad, and Walter Clarkson

At this point it seems like the top four are

Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Mathewson

Some AI's return the Clarkson family. There are two things wrong with this answer. (1) Two of them played before the year 1900, and (2) There are three of them. Do some two of them exceed the Mathewson's 373? No, but just barely.

I am *not* going to discuss whose record they broke since I suspect they were the first ever brother-pitcher combination.

- John Clarkson played from 1882-1894 and was 328-178. He is in the hall of fame.
- Dad Clarkson (thats his real name—he was their brother, not their dad) played from 1891-1896 and was 39-39. He is not in the hall of fame.
- Walter Clarkson played in 1904-1908 and was 18-16. He is not in the hall of fame.

If you count all three then there are $328 + 39 + 18 = 385$ wins which beats out the Mathewson's but not the Maddux's.

If you only count the top two, John and Dad, then there are $328 + 39 = 367$. This does not beat the Mathewson's but it puts them in fifth place.

I only found one other family with three brothers that were pitchers.

- Melido Perez played 1987-1995 and was 78-85.
- Pascal Perez played 1980-1991 and was 67-68.
- Carlos Perez played 1995-2000 and was 40-53.
- The total wins is 185.

5 How Did AI or the Web Do?

Here is a question I asked my graduate Ramsey Theory class on a HW. It was worth 0 points but I said they MUST do it.

In class I said that the Bernoulli's and the Kruskal's are the two best math families ever. This is not a formal statement; however, I am sure its true.

In baseball we really can ask such questions formally. We will just look at brothers who are both pitchers.

Phil Niekro won 318 games. His brother Joe won 221. So their total is 529 which is the most of any pair of brothers. So they are in first place.

Name the pairs of brothers who are in second place, third place, fourth place, and fifth place, in terms of total number of wins.

I don't expect anyone to know this off of their top of their heads so of course you can look it up.

Despite looking silly there really is a point to this question so you need to do it.

On the next page I have a table of the top 14 brother-combinations. To be as inclusive as possible I did the following.

1. I include both the top two Clarksons and all-3-Clarksons. I denote the three Clarkson as Clarkson-3. For that entry I (1) leave out individual totals, and (2) under Years1 I put the first and last year of the entire gang.
2. I include the three Perez Brothers. I don't bother with the top 2 of them which might be the 15th brother-combination.

Once you have this table you can decide what to count. I discuss that after the table.

I put a * next to all Hall of Famers.

Family	Wins1	Wins2	Total	Years1	Years2
Phil* & Joe Niekro	318	221	539	1964–1987	1967–1988
Gaylord* & Jim Perry	314	215	529	1962–1983	1959–1975
Greg* & Mike Maddux	355	39	394	1986–2008	1986–2000
Clarkson*-3			385	1882-1908	
Christy* & Harry Mathewson	373	0	373	1900–1916	1902
John* & Dad Clarkson	328	39	367	1882-1894	1891–1896
Pedro* & Ramon Martinez	219	135	354	1992–2009	1988–2001
Stan* & Harry Coveleski	215	81	296	1912–1928	1914-1918
Bob & Ken Forsch	168	114	282	1974–1989	1971–1986
Livan & Orlando Hernandez	168	111	279	1998–2010	1998–2010
Rick & Paul Reuschel	214	34	248	1972–1988	1975–1981
Dizzy* & Paul Dean	150	50	200	1930–1941	1934–1936
Perez 3			185	1980-2000	
Hooks & Snake Witse	139	29	168	1904–1915	1904–1909

Answers I consider reasonable for the top 5:

- Leave out the Clarkson’s since they were not in the modern era. Then the answer is
Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Mathewson-Martinez.
- Include Clarkson-2 but not Clarkson-3 since we asked for a pair of brothers. Then the answer is
Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Mathewson-Clarkson2
- Include Clarkson-3 but not Clarkson-2 since the motivating question was about families like the Kruskal’s which had 3, and the Bernoulli’s which had 8.
Then the answer is
Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Clarkson3-Mathewson-Martinez.

Any answer that leaves out Mathewson is wrong. Some AI’s did leave it out and when it was told this, admitted it was wrong but seemed to grumble that Harry being 0-1 shouldn’t count. A better argument to leave them out is that 1900 still wasn’t really modern baseball: Jack Chesbro won 41 games in 1904 is an indicator of that. But then the problem is, where do you draw the line?

6 We now look at the answers given, by Who, and how they did

We refer to counting two of the Clarkson as Clarkson-2 and three as Clarkson-3.

If an answer is *Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Mathewson-Martinez* then I say it is CORRECT.

All of the answers had Niekro-Perry.

If an answer omitted any of Maddux or Martinez its we mark it WRONG.

We do not need a category for those that omit Mathewson but, given that they don't want to count them (possibly because of Harry's 0-1 record) the rest is correct, never happened.

If an answer includes Clarkson-2 or Clarkson-3 and is correct given that then I say that it is OLD-FASHIONED

If an answer includes Clarkson-2 or Clarkson-3 and is incorrect given that we just say its WRONG.

1. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Martinez-Dean: WRONG

Google-Gemini

They left out the Mathewson's.

There are four pitchers-brothers inbetween Martinez and Dean.

Family	Wins1	Wins2	Total	Years1	Years2
Pedro* & Ramon Martinez	219	135	354	1992–2009	1988–2001
Stan* & Harry Coveleski	215	81	296	1912–1928	1914–1918
Bob & Ken Forsch	168	114	282	1974–1989	1971–1986
Livan & Orlando Hernandez	168	111	279	1998–2010	1998–2010
Rick & Paul Reuschel	214	34	248	1972–1988	1975–1981
Dizzy* & Paul Dean	150	50	200	1930–1941	1934–1936

2. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Mathewson-Clarkson: OLD-FASHIONED-1.

ONE student had this.

Website, Free ChatGPT

They are using Clarkson-2.

3. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Clarkson-Martinez: OLD FASHIONED-1.

ONE student had this.

Google-Gemini

4. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Clarkson-Mathewson OLD FASHIONED-4.

FOUR students had this.

Website, Website, Website, Website

They are using Clarkson-3.

5. Niekro-Perry-Martinez-Reuschel-Dean. WRONG-1.

ONE Student had this

Chat-GPT 5.2

There are three pitchers-brothers inbetween Martinez and Reuschel.

Family	Wins1	Wins2	Total	Years1	Years2
Pedro* & Ramon Martinez	219	135	354	1992–2009	1988–2001
Stan* & Harry Coveleski	215	81	296	1912–1928	1914-1918
Bob & Ken Forsch	168	114	282	1974–1989	1971–1986
Livan & Orlando Hernandez	168	111	279	1998–2010	1998–2010
Rick & Paul Reuschel	214	34	248	1972–1988	1975–1981

6. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Mathewson-Clarkson: OLD FASHIONED-1.

ONE STUDENT had this

They are using Clarkson-2.

7. Niekro-Perry-Clarkson-Coveleski-Forsch. WRONG-1

ONE Student had this

Two websites

Lets assume they are using Clarkson-2 though its hard to say since there is so much else wrong. Then they left out Martinez:

Family	Wins1	Wins2	Total	Years1	Years2
John* & Dad Clarkson	328	39	367	1882-1894	1891–1896
Pedro* & Ramon Martinez	219	135	354	1992–2009	1988–2001
Stan* & Harry Coveleski	215	81	296	1912–1928	1914-1918

8. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Mathewson-Martinez-Coveski. CORRECT-1

ONE Student had this using DeepSeek.

9. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Martinez-Forsch. WRONG-1

ONE Student had this

Gemini

Mathewson should be after Maddux, and there is a brother-pitcher pair between Martinez and Forsch.

Family	Wins1	Wins2	Total	Years1	Years2
Greg* & Mike Maddux	355	39	394	1986–2008	1986–2000
Christy* & Harry Mathewson	373	0	373	1900–1916	1902
Pedro* & Ramon Martinez	219	135	354	1992–2009	1988–2001
Stan* & Harry Coveleski	215	81	296	1912–1928	1914–1918
Bob & Ken Forsch	168	114	282	1974–1989	1971–1986
Livan & Orlando Hernandez	168	111	279	1998–2010	1998–2010

10. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Mathewson-Martinez. CORRECT-1.

ONE Student had this

Chat GPT-5 minl

11. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Coveleski-Forsch. WRONG.-1

Chat GPT

12. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Dean-Martinez. WRONG-1

Gemini Fast Version

13. Niekro-Perry-Maddux-Martinez-Dean. WRONG-1

Google Gemini Pro

7 Summary

1. 7 answers were WRONG
2. 7 answers were OLD-FASHIONED so perhaps you want to count them as correct.
3. 1 answer was CORRECT.
4. There were 13 *different* answers which is what I find the most surprising.